

Katowice, 30.08.2019

Professor at the University of Economics in Katowice Katarzyna Bilińska-Reformat Ph.D.
Katedra Zarządzania Marketingowego i Turystyki
[*Department of Marketing Management and Tourism*]
Wydział Zarządzania
[*Faculty of Management*]
Uniwersytet Ekonomiczny w Katowicach
[*University of Economics in Katowice*]

REVIEW

of the doctoral dissertation of MA Gabriel Shimon Hadad
entitled: “The Impact on Purchasing Behaviour of Consumers Living In Insecure Areas”
prepared under scientific supervision of Professor Bogna Pilarczyk Ph.D. University of
Economics Poznań
doctoral advisor Anna Rogala Ph.D.,
The Department of Marketing Strategies, Faculty of Management, University of Economics in
Poznan, pp. 208 (and annexes)

The basis for preparing the review is:

1. The Act of 14th March 2003 *on academic degrees and academic title and degrees and title in art* (D.Z. [*Journal of Law*] of 2003, no 65 item 565) as amended.
Under the Act the reviewer’s task is to determine whether “*the doctoral dissertation constitutes an original solution to a scientific problem (...), and the Doctoral candidate presents general theoretical knowledge in a given scientific discipline (...) and the ability to conduct independent scientific work*”.
2. Regulation of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of 30th October 2015 on specific procedures and conditions of execution of activities in the doctoral program,

in post-doctoral procedures and procedures for granting the title of professor (Dz. U. [Journal of Law] of 2015, item 1842),

3. Resolution of the Board of the Faculty of Management at University of Economics in Poznan, on appointing me the dissertation reviewer – a document of the Dean of the Faculty of Management, Professor Kazimierz Krzakiewicz, Ph.D. of 16th July 2019 (V/DWZ-w/850/2019).

I have prepared the review while referring to the research issues, the subject of the research, goals and hypotheses, methodology of conducted studies, as well as content-related and formal value of the work. The review is completed with final evaluation.

1. Evaluation of research issues, goals and hypotheses

Presented doctoral dissertation is located within the scientific discipline of economics and finances, while referring to the problems associated with consumer behaviour in marketing context. In the work the Author discusses in an interesting and original way, the issues of impact of marketing communication associated with emotions on behaviours of consumers residing in insecure areas. The work especially discusses the problem concerning a specific group of consumers (residing the insecure areas) which constitutes an important problem in terms of cognition, and certainly proves originality of the subject.

The issue of using communications associated with emotions by enterprises and their impact on consumer behaviours constitutes one of the most topical problems concerning marketing communication. In contemporary environment emotions are increasingly more often used to achieve sales targets which is not always ethical. In my opinion the subject area discussed by the Author is interesting, original and topical as well as it fits in the paradigm of behavioural economics. The main area of interest of behavioural economics is the analysis of motives and principles of human actions in complex and uncertain conditions that can be frequently faced on contemporary market. Research achievements in behavioural economics are more and more widely used in various areas, also in marketing activity, especially including the area of marketing communication. This knowledge is used by politicians, business or people responsible for solving social problems.

It should be added that little space is devoted in the literature on the subject to the issues concerning the impact of marketing communication associated with emotions on marketing behaviours of consumers residing in insecure areas, which is done by the Author of

the dissertation. Through research presented in the dissertation, the Author firstly identifies the research gap and secondly formulates valuable conclusions.

Summing up, I believe that the chosen subject area, justification of its implementation and the title of the dissertation definitely fulfil the requirements that doctoral dissertations should meet.

It can be stated that the Doctoral Candidate conducted really satisfying analysis of the literature on the subject which is proved by the list of publications presented in the bibliography. Presented bibliography content is really comprehensive which should be appreciated. The reviewed work comprises four chapters and the conclusion, as well as two annexes. Altogether the work has 228 pages. The structure of the work is appropriate, the fact of symmetry between the size of chapters should be commended. Three first chapters of the dissertation are theoretical. In the fourth, the Author presents methodology of conducted research and its results.

Individual chapters of the work are logically linked; through their development, the Author implemented the goals assumed in the dissertation, answered the formulated research questions and verified the adopted research hypotheses. The work includes 32 tables, 8 graphs and 8 figures, which significantly simplifies understanding of presented content. Most of presented tables and figures are prepared by the Author himself, which proves his skill of synthetisation of research material. In my view, the skill of graphic presentation of content that might be complicated should be appreciated.

The dissertation starts with the introduction that locates the issues of the doctoral dissertation in the achievements of behavioural economics. The introduction to the work (pp. 8-16) has the nature of presentation of the subject area of the dissertation. It includes comprehensive explanation of reasons for implementation of the subject area of the work, contains the goal (even though it is explicitly formulated in the dissertation abstract on p. 3), presents the research methodology and applied research tools. It constitutes a part of the dissertation which is correct in substantive and formal terms. In my opinion, presentation of rather similar content in the abstract and introduction is useless; from the point of view of formal requirements, the very introduction would be enough for the structure of the dissertation.

Taking into account the goals adopted for implementation, I state that they are basically formulated correctly even though I have doubts about the goal formulated in the following way: „Moreover, the author wishes to analyse consumer behaviours when exposed to negative messages with appeal, as well as the concept of subliminal messages and negative

messages”. It needs to be noticed that the very analysis cannot be the goal of research; it can only constitute the research method allowing for its achievement.

The Author correctly formulated 4 research questions and assumed 4 research hypotheses for verification. In my view the hypotheses included in empirical part should also be highlighted in the introduction to the work and not only in chapter 4 item 4.1 entitled “Research Methodology”. In the approach presented by the Doctoral Candidate there is no indication of the main hypothesis and specific hypotheses. I think that hypotheses are correctly formulated. In the introduction there is no precise indication of the objective and subjective scope as well as time and spatial range of the work.

It is unfortunate that the Author does not emphasise in the introduction that the work is located within behavioural economics and does not present the research gap.

2. Content-related evaluation of the dissertation

Submitted doctoral dissertation proves the Author’s knowledge in the discipline of economics and finance and shows his skill in conducting scientific research. Evaluating the deliberations included in the dissertation I state that the Author presents good knowledge about the latest trends and phenomena associated with behavioural economics, especially the marketing aspects related to emotional buying behaviours of consumers. The content structure adopted in the dissertation proves that it is a complex and comprehensive study. The work of MA Gabriel Shimon Hadad is interesting and original. The Author presents his deliberations in four logically connected chapters. However I think that the chapters have too many short subsections that could be integrated in a bigger whole. For example pp 1.3.2 covers two pages of the work and pp. 1.3.6 less than two pages.

The first chapter is devoted to the concept of marketing communication. It conceptualises the notion of marketing communication. In the first chapter, the Author specifies the role of marketing communication in marketing strategies of enterprises. The Author describes in detail 3 models of consumer behaviour with reference to marketing communication: 1. Hierarchy of Effects Model, 2. Information Processing Model and 3. Elaboration Likelihood model. At the same time he indicates the evolution in the approach to models of communication and presents the background of their changes. Subsection 1.3 that describes psychological aspects used in marketing communication, including those based on fear and anxiety is an interesting part of the chapter.

Persuasive role of such communication is indicated. The first chapter fully reflects the research subject of the work; however the feeling of insufficiency arises towards the lack of explicitly formulated opinions of the Author. He quotes specific approaches found in the literature and concerning the discussed issues, but he does not address them. As abovementioned, the content of the chapter includes too many subsections.

I also think that every chapter should inform the reader at the very beginning about the implemented goals, the research questions that will be answered, and which research hypotheses will be verified (at least partly). The chapters also lack clear summaries on what is achieved in them. In my view, separation of a clear summary in each chapter in which the Doctoral Candidate refers to the scope of implementation of goals and indicates the level of verification of specific hypotheses would allow to understand presented content more easily.

In the second chapter the Author focuses of the issues concerning Human Psychology and its Consequences for Consumer Behaviours. It is unfortunate that in presented deliberations there is no reference to the evolution of achievements in behavioural economics. My comment has polemical character and can only show the possibility to expand the presented threads in the work. In the second chapter the Author does not define the research category of “Consumer Behaviour” that is vital from the point of view of the work. I do not mean detailed deliberations in this sphere but only synthetic presentation and interpretation of the notion.

In the second chapter, section 2.4 entitled “Effects of Persuasion on Consumer Behaviours” should be appreciated. The Author presents in the synthetic way the key notions from the point of view of the subject area presented in the work. In my opinion, the chapter has too many subsections that should be integrated into a bigger whole. Each of the listed subsections, i.e. 2.4.1, 2.4.2,2.4.3 consists of one page.

Chapter two is rather chaotic; it discusses a lot of secondary threads that depart from the main subject of the work. The Doctoral Candidate uses the notions that are not explained by him earlier, for example he does not indicate what “different aspect” of marketing research he describes. Such information in my view should be provided at the beginning of the subsection and the aspects should be described consistently with adopted order. It is unfortunate that the Author does not present the issue in a synthetic table.

I have the impression that part of the content included in chapter two discusses the threads that have already been addressed in sufficient extent in the first chapter. For example, in section 2.2 (p. 62), the Author repeats the content included in chapter one section 1.2.3 (p. 35).

After reading chapter two, I also have an editorial comment as the Author uses irrelevant spacing between paragraphs.

In chapter three the Doctoral Candidate describes the political situation in Israel. In my view the chapter lacks clearly defined research category of “Insecure Areas” which is vital for the subject of the work. What are the typical features of such areas from economic point of view? The chapter is rather chaotic and highlights the threads concerning historical aspects, which is certainly important, but they do not bring important value for the implementation of the goals of the work. Similarly to the first and second chapter, due to little content, some subsections should be integrated. This concerns subsections 3.1.2, 3.1.3, 3.1.4, 3.1.5, 3.1.6. It is unfortunate that the Author does not summarise the chapter while showing specific consumer behaviours typical of “Insecure areas”.

The last, fourth chapter, has the empirical nature. In the first subsection, the Author describes in detail the procedure and methodology of conducted studies, whereas in further of them he presents their results. The use of statistical methods in the research process should be appreciated. I wish to emphasise high quality of empirical research conducted for the needs of verification of the hypotheses and accuracy in explaining further steps undertaken in the process of analysis. This proves advanced level of the Doctoral Candidate’s research workshop.

I consider the applied methodological approach to be relevant. Conducted analysis of the literature on the subject is the basis for direct studies. The Author conducted quantitative direct research while using structured interview. Pages 112-113 present applied research techniques for quantitative research and then the Author presents the logic of construction of the structured interview on pp. 118-119, which definitely facilitates understanding of the conducted research process. I find it a good solution. The research was conducted with the use of survey questionnaire composed of 5 parts and questions concerning the respondents’ particulars.

In the paper the Author used the six-grade scale. Due to this, the following question arises: What made the Author adopt such a scale?

The survey was conducted according to planned scenario. Presented results of research are interesting and provide a view on buying behaviours of consumers under the influence of marketing communication associated with emotions.

I think that the title of subsection 4.3. should have a different wording, for example “Various factors influencing consumer purchases – results of direct study”. Such a title would

reflect better the content of this sub-section and would not suggest that the “Analysis” was the Author’s objective.

The Author rightly indicated limitations to conducted studies. Despite abovementioned deficiencies, in my view the empirical chapter is valuable in terms of cognition.

I state that the content presented in specific chapters of the work is closely related to discussed research subject area. I think that in the work there are no references to formulated goals and research questions as well as hypotheses.

In the conclusion to the work the Author referred to the level of verification of the research hypotheses and formulated conclusions resulting from the work. However, the conclusions lack clear reference to research questions formulated in the introduction of the dissertation. At the same time there is no explicit information concerning implementation of the dissertation objective, as well as filling the research gap identified before.

Conclusions

Evaluating the doctoral dissertation of MA Gabriel Shimon Hadad in terms of the article 13 item 1 of the Act of 14th March 2003 (D.Z. [*Journal of Law*] no 65, item 595 as amended) and thus answering the question whether the dissertation represents an original solution to the scientific problem, whether the doctoral candidate shows general theoretical knowledge in a given scientific discipline or whether he has the ability to conduct independent scientific work, I state as follows:

1. The doctoral dissertation of MA Gabriel Shimon Hadad constitutes an original solution to a scientific problem and substantially contributes to economic sciences, especially the discipline of economics and finances. The discussed subject area is topical and interesting, especially in the context of changes in consumer behaviours.
2. The subject area is topical and cognitively interesting from the scientific point of view, which is proved by increasingly greater interest in behavioural economics of many researchers.
3. While evaluating content-related side of the dissertation, its advantages must be emphasised. I perceive the assumed goals and formulated hypotheses as well as research questions to be valuable and ambitious on scientific and cognitive level. Such an evaluation is proved by several reasons and arguments. Firstly, the subject area related to consumer behaviours in insecure areas is poorly recognised in the literature. The next argument that arises here is associated with the open character of the scientific problem

formulated in the introduction to the dissertation which the dissertation attempts to solve. I perceive the open character of the issue and at the same time the attempt to formulate the answer which is appropriate in scientific terms (theory and methodology) and related to the impact of marketing communication associated with emotions on consumer behaviours as a value of the reviewed dissertation.

4. If analysis of the subject of consumer behaviours and impact of marketing communication associated with emotions on these behaviours on theoretical level is already noticed in the literature, it needs to be noticed that there are no works showing its empirical knowledge in specific market reality, in this case concerning insecure areas. The value of the reviewed dissertation is recognised in the ambitious attempt at recognition of the impact of marketing communication associated with emotions on consumers residing in insecure areas.
5. It can be stated that the Author of the dissertation proved his knowledge in the area of economics in the discipline of economics and finances and showed the skill of identification of research gaps based on comprehensive analysis of the literature on the subject.
6. Literature studies conducted by the Doctoral Candidate in the dissertation as well as his own studies show his ability to conduct scientific research.

Summing up, in my view, the contribution of the presented dissertation to science is proved by implementation of the activities in three dimensions (cognitive, methodological and application-related):

1. An attempt to fill a cognitive gap through indicating theoretical basis for the use of marketing communication associated with emotions in influencing buying behaviours of consumers residing in the insecure areas.
2. Proposed methodology of consumer studies residing in insecure areas.
3. Showing the possibility to use communication associated with emotions in influencing the consumers residing in insecure areas as an important application value. However, the question of ethics in implementation of such activities arises.

The analysis of adopted structure of the dissertation, its objectives and scopes allows to state that despite indicated deficiencies, it meets the formal as well as content-related requirements that scientific works of promotional character have to meet under the Act.

My final conclusion as the reviewer of the dissertation of MA Gabriel Shimon Hadad entitled “The impact on Purchasing Behaviour of Consumers Living in Insecure Areas” is the confirmation that the dissertation meets the formal requirements determined for doctoral

dissertations included in regulations of law and can be publicly defended at the Faculty of Management at the University of Economics in Poznan.

A square image containing a handwritten signature in blue ink. The signature is stylized and appears to be 'J. Kępczyński'.